

Proceedings of the public hearing conducted on 20.9.2011 in connection with the application filed by Municipal Corporation, Ludhiana for getting Environmental clearance as required under the EIA notification dated 14.9.2006 for setting up of an Integrated Municipal Solid Waste Management Facility, at Village Jainpur , Ludhiana (Punjab).

The following were present to supervise the proceedings:-

1. Sh. Pardeep Aggarwal, IAS,
Addl. Deputy Commissioner, Ludhiana
2. Er. Krunesh Garg,
Senior Environmental Engineer,
Punjab Pollution Control Board,
Zonal Office-2, Ludhiana.
3. Sh. A.S.Sekhon,
Additional Commissioner,
Municipal Corporation, Ludhiana
4. Er. Telinder Kumar,
Environmental Engineer,
Punjab Pollution Control Board,
Regional Office, Ludhiana.
5. Er. S.S. Matharu,
Environmental Engineer (Mega),
Punjab Pollution Control Board,
Head Office, Patiala.

Environmental Engineer (Mega), Punjab Pollution Control Board, Patiala welcomed the officers supervising and presiding over the hearing and people from adjoining towns/villages, who came to attend the public hearing of the project. He informed that the Municipal Corporation, Ludhiana has applied for environmental clearance in the office of the State Level Environment Impact Assessment Authority, Punjab for getting environment clearance under EIA notification no. 1533 (E) dated 14.9.2006 for establishment of an Integrated Municipal Solid Waste Management Facility, at Jainpur Village, Ludhiana (Punjab) and after considering the project proposal by the said Authority, 'Terms of Reference' were issued to Municipal Corporation for preparation of draft rapid EIA report. However, after issuance of Office

Memorandum dated 28.04.2011 by the MoEF regarding as critically polluted areas, the application was forwarded to MoEF, New Dehli due applicability of General Condition to this project. He apprised the persons present there about the requirement of public hearing before deciding the application filed by the Corporation for getting the said clearance. He also brought into the notice of public that the Corporation has submitted copies of draft rapid EIA report along with the Executive summary of the same and a copy of each said documents was placed in the office of Deputy Commissioner, Ludhiana; E.O., M.C., Ludhiana, Zila Parishad, Ludhiana; General Manager, District Industries Centre, Ludhiana, Regional Office of MoEF at Chandigarh and Regional Office, Ludhiana of the PPCB for access to the public and other stakeholders. He further brought out that a notice of public hearing was published in 'The Tribune and 'Ajit' on 20.8.2011 to make the public aware regarding date, time & venue of public hearing and about the places / offices, where the public could access the draft EIA report and its Executive summary report before the said hearing. Thereafter, he requested the representative of the Environmental Consultant of the Corporation to elaborate about the main features of the project and the draft EIA study report.

Dr. Ravinder Mohan Mehta, who is the Environmental Consultant of Municipal Corporation, Ludhiana for preparation of Rapid EIA report brought out the details of the project before the public as under:

1. To improve the scenario of Municipal Solid Waste (MSW) management in the State of Punjab, Department of Local Government, Government of Punjab has initiated development of Municipal Solid Waste (MSW) projects for collection, storage, segregation, transportation, processing and disposal of MSW in a scientific manner.
2. Ludhiana cluster Project is one of the 8 MSW cluster Projects being developed by Govt. of Punjab. It is proposed to connect 13 Urban Local Bodies with Ludhiana cluster for management and handling of MSW in a scientific manner.
3. The processing plant is proposed to be set up at Jainpur village, Ludhiana in an area of 32 acres, which is located at a distance of about 10 Km from

the city centre. In this plant, municipal solid waste will be converted to produce an utilizable Refuse Derived Fuel (RDF). The fines to be separated from the MSW containing organic component and nutrient value will be processed in a composting plant to produce utilizable manure and soil enrichment product .The rejects(inerts) to be produced from the processing plant will also be treated and disposed at the Engineered Sanitary landfill site to be developed at the same site for their scientific disposal .

4. Currently, the total waste generated by the Ludhiana city and in the other towns/cities of Ludhiana cluster is being transported to the earmarked sites in the respective towns/ cities where waste is being dumped indiscriminately in an unscientific manner.
5. Ludhiana City has been divided into four zones and the MSW collected from all four Zone is being disposed off at Jamalpur site.
6. The State Level Environment Impact Assessment Authority (SEIAA), Punjab had issued Terms of Reference for preparation of draft rapid EIA study report.
7. A Rapid EIA study report has been prepared for this project based the secondary information collected from the published sources, reconnaissance survey, primary socio-economic survey and environmental monitoring of air, noise, soil, ground water and surface water in the study area. The baseline data were generated on meteorology, air quality, noise levels, ground and surface water quality, land environment including soil quality, land use pattern, biological environment and the socio-economic status. The meteorological data for one season has also been collected to know the prevailing seasonal conditions.
8. The integrated facility will have the following components:
 - i. Direct collection of segregated MSW (Door to Door Collection) within Municipal limits of all ULBs of Ludhiana Cluster.

- ii. Storage & Transportation of segregated MSW from secondary collection points of all ULBs of Ludhiana cluster to the MSW processing site at Ludhiana.
 - iii. MSW processing facility to process 342 TPD of MSW has been planned.
 - iv. Compost Plant to handle organic waste will be installed. Organic components of MSW segregated during RDF Process will be treated in the compost plant to produce manure
 - v. An engineered sanitary landfill site for scientific disposal of rejects/inerts at Village Jainpur will be developed within the existing dumping site.
9. At present no municipal solid waste is dumped at this site from Ludhiana cluster.
10. The proposed site is accessible from National Highway- 1, which is running parallel to the North-East boundary of the project site. Buddha Nala passes near from North – East side of present dumping Jainpur site.

11. PROJECT UTILITIES/AMENITIES

- The water requirement for the proposed project has been estimated to be around 30 m³/day and would be supplied by Municipal corporation. The sewage generated during the operation phase will be sent to sewage treatment plant located adjacent to the facility.
- Required power will be sourced from State Electricity Board.
- Fire protection system will be provided as per LPA (Loss Prevention Association) norms. For every 100 m² area of plant, one DCP type and one CO₂ type fire extinguisher will be provided. “No Smoking” and hazard / danger warning stickers will be put up at appropriate places. All personnel deployed for the construction, erection and operation of the plant will be given proper training for fire drill. Emergency numbers will also be put up at appropriate places. Empty fuel drums / tanks and other inflammable material will be stored in earmarked place and removed from the premises as soon as possible. Storage yard for chemicals and fuel lubricants will also be provided with fire extinguishers and sand bucket racks.

- All roads in the plant area will be well-designed bitumen roads and will be of 4 m wide with 1m wide berm on each side.

12. ENVIRONMENTAL SETTING OF THE STUDY AREA

The baseline environmental status was assessed based on primary and secondary data collected through on-site field observations and obtained from agencies such as IMD, Geological Survey of India, State Ground Water Department, Central Ground Water Board, State Pollution Control Board, Census of India and Local Forest Department. The following environmental components were focused at during this study:

- Air Environment (Meteorology, Ambient Air Quality, Noise Levels, Traffic Pattern, etc.)
- Water Environment (Quality of Surface and Groundwater sources)
- Land Environment (Geology, Hydrogeology, Landuse, Solid Waste generation and characteristics)
- Ecological Environment (Terrestrial and Aquatic Flora & Fauna)
- Socio-Economic Environment (Demographic profile, Occupational structure, Educational status, Literacy status, etc.)

13. ENVIRONMENTAL IMPACT ASSESSMENT & ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT PLAN

- Environmental impact due to the construction and operation stages of the project were predicted quantitatively using models such as ISCST3 for air dispersion calculations.
- Adequate environmental management measures will be incorporated during the entire planning, construction and operation stages of the project to minimize the adverse environmental impacts and assure sustainable development of the area.
- The impacts during the construction phase will be temporary in nature.

14. The summary details the pollution sources and mitigation measures proposed for the project.

a) Air Environment

- During the construction phase, operation of construction equipments and vehicles will be the main sources of pollution. A dust control plan will be implemented and regular maintenance of vehicles and equipment will be carried out.
- During the operation phase, from RDF plant, fugitive dust and odor emissions from waste handling and processing and emissions due to vehicular movement. Adequate mitigation measures shall be implemented. Emissions from waste handling areas shall be controlled by provision of covered areas, proper ventilation and by maintaining negative pressure. The RDF plant shall be provided with adequate dust control systems such as cyclones and bag filters to control the dust emissions.

b. Noise Environment

- During the construction phase, adequate mitigative measures such as controlled time of construction, job rotation etc. will be implemented.
- During the operation phase, the sources of noise emissions shall be equipments such as shredders, and vehicular movement. Noise enclosures shall be provided wherever possible and workers shall be provided with ear plugs.

c. Water Environment

During the construction phase, a septic tank shall be provided to treat the domestic wastewater to be generated. Effluent generated from the process will be recirculated back to the RDF plant. Spill over from the process would be collected and treated prior to proper disposal. The small quantities of leachate generated will be collected in the sump and treated in the existing treatment plant.

d. Ecological Environment

There is no ecologically sensitive area within a 10 km radial distance of the project site. No wildlife sanctuary or national park is present within the study area. A peripheral greenbelt will be provided.

e. Socio Economic Environment

The proposed project will lead to employment generation and will have a positive impact on the socio economic environment. Preference to local population shall be given and adequate mitigation measures will be ensured to reduce odor emissions and disease vectors from proposed site.

f. ENVIRONMENTAL MANAGEMENT SYSTEM

For the effective implementation of the EMP, an Environmental Management System (EMS) will be established at the proposed project. The EMS will include the following:

- An Environmental Management cell
- Environmental Monitoring Program
- Personnel Training
- Regular Environmental Audits and Corrective Action
- Documentation – Standard operating procedures Environmental Management Plans and other records.

Thereafter, Environmental Engineer brought into the notice of public present at the venue of hearing that as per the provision of EIA notification dated 14.9.2006 as amended time to time, the persons present at the venue may seek information or clarifications on the project from the project promoter/consultant. It was also brought into the notice of the persons present there that the information or clarifications sought by them and reply given by the project promoter will be recorded in the proceeding of the hearing, which will be sent to the MoEF, New Delhi for further consideration. Accordingly, he requested the persons present in the hearing to seek information or clarifications on the project one by one.

Thereupon, the detail of the information/ clarifications raised by the persons present at the venue of hearing and the reply given by the consultant of the industry / project proponent is as under:

Sr. No	Name of the person	Detail of query / statement / information / clarification sought by the person present at the	Reply of the query / statement / information /
---------------	---------------------------	--	---

		venue of hearing.	clarification given by the consultant of the Corporation
1.	Sh. Amrik Singh, Vill. Partappsur, Member Panchayat & Block Samiti, Distt. Ludhiana	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ At the time when this site was active and the Municipal Solid Waste was dumped at this site, about only 10-20% of the total solid waste was received at this site and remaining was dumped here & there. ➤ There is no need to provide any green belt as told by the environment consultant of Municipal Corporation, Ludhiana since our area has a lot of greenery. ➤ With the establishment of proposed plant, there is likelihood of spreading diseases like malaria and dengue etc. Thus, we are not in favour of establishment of the project at this site and we will not allow to establish the same at the site in any case. 	-Nil-
2.	Sh. Harpinder Singh, Vill. Ayali Khurd, Ludhiana	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ As per Master Plan of Ludhiana, the site of the project is located in the residential zone, as such, the site is not suitable for establishment of the proposed Municipal Solid Waste (Management & Handling) Rules, 2000 facility. ➤ There are PUDA approved residential colonies, Mandir and Gurudwaras in the vicinity of the proposed site of the project and the 	-Nil

		<p>Punjab Pollution Control Board has already restrained the Municipal Corporation not to dump the solid waste at this site.</p> <p>➤ Moreover, the underground water has been contaminated due to dumping of solid waste at this site and after establishment of the proposed plant it will pollute the environment upto 5 km due to discharge of toxic gases which will effect the health of the residents of the area. Thus, we will not allow to establish the Integrated Municipal Solid Waste facility at this site.</p>	
3.	<p>Dr. A.L Bhandari, Professor (Retd), Punjab Agriculture University, South City, Ludhiana</p>	<p>➤ This facility should not be allowed to establish in the Urban Area rather it should be establish at low lying and in low density residential area i.e. near river Sutlej.</p>	-Nil-
4.	<p>Sh. Karamjit Singh, Gram Panchayat, Malakpur, Distt. Ludhiana</p>	<p>➤ What so ever told by environment consultant of Municipal Corporation is totally wrong since spreading of Jaundice in area is only due to already dumped Municipal Solid Waste. Hence, we are opposing the establishment of Integrated Municipal Solid Waste facility at this site and we will not allow to establish the same at this site at any cost. He reiterated that in case, the Government takes any steps for establishment of the facility, we will initiate further action as per law</p>	-Nil

		against the Corporation.	
5	Sh. Manoj Nayyar, Parbella Extension Colony, Ludhiana	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Due to dumping of solid waste at this site, the residents of the area are victim of its pollution for the last 30 years. ➤ It is fundamental duty of every the citizen to oppose the establishment of the Municipal Solid Waste facility at this site. ➤ Samples of ground water were collected in the vicinity of dump site area and the analysis results of which show that the ground water of the area is not potable. ➤ The developed countries, which have installed the Municipal Solid Waste facility, could not get success. As such, it is not possible to get success for such facility in our country. ➤ The EIA report prepared by the environment consultant does not contain the facts. 	-Nil-
6.	Sh. Sadhu Singh, Vill. Malakpur, Ludhiana	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ The municipal dump site was forcibly taken from us and we could not get its actual price due to which have become economically weaker. ➤ Due to dumping of municipal waste in an unscientific manner upto a height of 20', we have to remain caution at all the time since there remain likelihood of fire in the waste at all the times which may damage our crops. ➤ The Municipal Corporation never sprayed any insecticide on the solid 	-Nil-

		<p>waste dump to stop the odour problem.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ We will not allow to establish the facility at this site. 	
7.	Sh. Sham Singh, Vill. Harika, Ludhiana	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Earlier, the corporation had started dumping the solid waste in the revenue estate of Partap Singh Wala and the said dump had to shift due to breeding place of flies. ➤ The Municipal Corporation has proposed to shift the waste dumped at this site to another site located near Sulej but nothing has been done in this regard, so far. ➤ Municipal Corporation, Ludhiana turned into Municipal Corporation about a couple of years back and the council had taken this land from the residents of the area forcibly. ➤ In case facility is established at this site, it will become a breeding place of flies and mosquitoes due to which disease will be spread in the area. Thus we oppose the establishment of Municipal Solid Waste facility at this site. 	-Nil-
8.	Sh. Hemat Saraf, Delhi Public School, Ludhiana	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ In rapid EIA report, it has been mentioned that the site of the facility is located at a distance of 10 km from Ludhiana City, which is totally wrong since DPS School is located nearby the proposed site. In this report it has also been mentioned that the facility will be developed in 26 	-Nil-

		<p>acres, which may become breeding place of flies and a source of disease.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ Due to unscientific disposal of Municipal Solid Waste at this site, there is a odour problem which effects the study of the students of their School. So, I request to establish the Municipal Solid Waste facility at some other suitable site outside the city limits. 	
9.	Sh. Sunil Tiwari, Golf Link Colony, Ludhiana	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ About 35 years back when this site was identified for disposal of solid waste, there is no residential area nearby to it. Later on the Municipal Corporation, Ludhiana went on increasing the limits, but the solid waste dumping site remained there. Now, the dumping site has been declared as residential zone as per the Master Plan of Ludhiana. ➤ There is no mention of Sidhwan Canal in the rapid EIA report, which flows nearby the proposed site. ➤ The Municipal Corporation will not be in a position to treat the leachate to be generated after commissioning of the facility. Thus, there is likelihood of contamination of ground water with the establishment of the facility. ➤ With the establishment of the Municipal Solid Waste facility there will be liberation of H₂S gas, which is very harmful since it causes direct effect on the 	-Nil-

		<p>respiratory system. The European countries have failed to control the said gas.</p> <p>➤ Rights have also been provided by the Hon'ble Supreme Court of India for potable water and clean air, as such, we oppose the establishment of this project.</p>	
10.	Sh. Rajesh Gupta, General Manager, M/s Janpath Estate (P) Ltd., Ludhiana	<p>➤ There is no mention of Municipal Solid Waste facility at this site in the Master Plan of Ludhiana as such before establishment of this facility, the Master Plan of Ludhiana may be taken into account and the facility should not be established in the residential area.</p>	-Nil-
11.	Sh. Vikas Singh, Vill. Malakpur, Ludhiana	<p>➤ The present Municipal Solid Waste dumped at this site is a source of spreading diseases like Jaundice and Dengue in the area.</p> <p>➤ The Municipal Solid Waste facility should be established away from the residential area.</p>	-Nil-
12.	Sh. Nachattar Singh, Vill. Malakpur, Ludhiana	<p>➤ We oppose the establishment of Municipal Solid Waste facility and we will not allow to establish the said facility at this site.</p>	-Nil-
13.	Jathedar Labh Singh, Malakpur Bet, Ludhiana	<p>➤ We oppose the establishment of Integrated Municipal Solid Waste facility and in case, we have to sacrifice our lives</p>	-Nil-

		to oppose its establishment, we are ready to do it. This may be treated as out threat or request.	
14.	Sh. Netar Singh, Sarpanch Dashmesh Nagar, Ayali Khurd, Ludhiana.	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ When the Municipal Solid Waste was dumped at this site and at that time this waste came in our streets and houses, which was a great nuisance for us. ➤ We are thankful to the present Government who stopped dumping of waste at this site. We all are of the opinion that we will not allow to establish Municipal Solid Waste facility at this site. 	-Nil-
15.	Sh. Manpreet Singh, Vill. Ayali Khurd, Chairman Zila Parishad, Ludhiana	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> ➤ The Municipal Corporation continued dumping the solid waste at this site for the last 30-35 years, and it was a source of odour problem due to which diseases were spreading in the area. ➤ The Municipal Solid Waste dumping site, where the Integrated Municipal Solid Waste facility is to be established, is a residential area as per the Master Plan due to which no. of residential colonies such as 'Pabella City' and 'Golf Link' etc. have been developed nearby the dumping site. ➤ This is a pollution free area in Ludhiana city which will be polluted with the establishment of the Municipal Solid Waste facility. Thus, this facility should be established away from the residential area. ➤ There are no. of 	-Nil-

		<p>educational institutions such as Samrock school, Sacret Heart School and DSP School etc., in the vicinity of the proposed site of the facility.</p> <p>➤ We all residents of the area oppose the establishment of the Municipal Solid Waste facility at this site and we will not allow to establish the same in any case.</p>	
--	--	---	--

Environmental Engineer of the Board further requested the persons present at the venue of hearing that if any one else want to seek any information / clarification on the proposed project, thereupon, all the persons present in the public hearing spoke that they are not in favour of establishment of Integrated MSW facility at this site. This public hearing was attended by 110 number of people.

The detail of the comments/objections received during public hearing are as under:

Sr. No.	Name of the person/organization	Date of receipt	Comments/Objections /Suggestions	Remarks
1.	M/s Rajan Colonizers Ltd., Humbran Road, Ayalikhurd, Ludhiana.	19.9.2011	As per Master plan the site of the facility is located in the residential zone and there is an educational institution namely Delhi Public School nearby the site of the facility as such, the site of the facility is not suitable.	Annexure-1
2.	M/s Janpath Estate (P) Ltd., Ludhiana	19.9.2011	This site is reserved for residential area as per the Master Plan, thus, the MSW facility should not be established at this site. The said facility may be established in	Annexure-2

			the earmarked area as per the Master Plan.	
3.	Sarpanch, Gram Panchayat Ayali Khurd, Ludhiana	19.9.2011.	This site is not suitable for MSW facility and the PPCB should cancel the NOC to this facility.	Annexure-3
4.	Sarpanch, Gram Panchayat Jainpur.	19.9.2011	-do-	Annexure-4
5.	Residents of village Malikpur, Distt. Ludhiana	19.9.2011	-do-	Annexure-5
6.	PPR Association-II Hambran Road, Ludhiana	19.9.2011	-do-	Annexure-6
7.	Smt. Seema Aggarwal W/o Sh. Mukesh Aggarwal R/o Hambran, Distt. Ludhiana	20.9.2011	The MSW facility should not be established at this site.	Annexure-7
8.	Smt. Sakuntla Kharbanda W/o sh. Subhash Chander, 108-B, Rishi Nagar, Ludhiana.	20.9.2011	-do-	Annexure-8
9.	Sh. Jai Deep Kharbanda Parvela City, Ludhiana	20.9.2011	-do-	Annexure-9
10.	Sh. Nand Lal S/o Sh. Kamal Desh Gupta, Fortune Estate, Ludhiana	20.9.2011	-do-	Annexure-10
11.	Principal Jesus Sacred Heart School, Ludhiana	20.9.2011	The garbage already dumped at site is breeding place of flies & Mosquitoes and it causes unhealthy environment to the students of the school, thus, the garbage dumped at site should be removed immediately.	Annexure-11
12.	Om Shri Sai Sewa Trust (Regd.) Sai	20.9.2011	The site of the facility in located nearby the	Annexure-

	Nagar, Humbran Road, Ludhiana		Mandir and large no. of pilgrims come here and establishment of facility at this site will hurt the feelings of pilgrims. Therefore, the facility should not be established at this site.	12
13.	Residents of Kithchlu Nagar & Pawela Colony	20.092011	There are serious errors in the rapid EIA study report, as such, it should be quashed and the proposed site should be developed as a park.	Annexure-13

The hearing ended with vote of thanks to the Supervisor-Cum-Presiding Officer and the public present in the hearing.

(S.S. Matharu)
Environmental Engineer (Mega),
Punjab Pollution Control Board,
Head Office, Patiala.

(Krunesh Garg)
Senior Env. Engineer,
Pb. Pollution Control Board,
Zonal Office-2, Ludhiana.

(Pardeep Aggarwal), IAS
Addl. Deputy Commissioner,
Ludhiana

(Tejinder Kumar),
Environmental Engineer
Pb. Pollution Control Board,
Regional Office-III,
Ludhiana